BUCHAREST UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMIC STUDIES



**Council for Doctoral Studies**
**Doctoral School of Economics and International Affairs**

**DOCTORAL THESIS**

**Publicly Presented and Defended by the Author:**
**MIHAIL (G.D.) PĂDURARU**

**Title of the Doctoral Thesis:**
**ECONOMIC INTELLIGENCE, COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE, AND ECONOMIC ESPIONAGE, NEW DEVELOPMENTS OF PUBLIC AND PRIVATE INTERESTS IN THE BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT.**

Doctoral Advisor: Prof. Dr. Radu Cristian MUȘETESCU

**Bucharest**
**July, 2024**

**Doctoral Thesis Defense Committee:**

(Title) Dr. (First Name Last Name) (Chair) - (Name of University)
(Title) Dr. (First Name Last Name) (Member) - (Name of University)
(Title) Dr. (First Name Last Name) (Member) - (Name of University)
(Title) Dr. (First Name Last Name) (Member) - (Name of University)
(Title) Dr. (First Name Last Name) (Member) - (Name of University)

*MOTTO*

"The knowledge of the whole is not limited to the knowledge of its constituent parts.

Everything has its secrets." Georges Perec

**OVERVIEW**

This thesis, aligned with the doctoral program in INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC RELATIONS, focuses on the research area of economic intelligence, competitive intelligence, and economic espionage, and examines the capacity of nations to develop capabilities for the collection and analysis of economic intelligence, with the aim of gaining competitive advantages in the international business environment. Recognizing the complexity of these fields, the work does not aspire to an exhaustive coverage of the subject but has set objectives aimed at, through the synthesis of specialized literature and the analysis of concepts increasingly used in the international business environment, identifying ways in which the unification of public and private interests leads to enhanced economic competitiveness.

The goal is to systematize the presented information in a clear manner, making it possible to conduct a multidisciplinary analysis of the areas of interest for research.

Starting from the premise that not all readers of this work are familiar with the subject matter, the structure of the thesis is designed to facilitate a progressive understanding, with each chapter being autonomous and capable of being read independently, while still maintaining thematic coherence and unity. This approach allows for selective reading and outlines a continuous narrative that reviews and clarifies various concepts from the specialized literature, culminating in critical observations and final conclusions, through the presentation of a personal perspective on the research hypothesis.

At the same time, this effort does not limit itself to merely recounting established theories and practices from the specialized literature but seeks to provide a nuanced analysis of the concepts and activities associated with the fields of economic intelligence, competitive intelligence, and economic espionage.

The author, aware of the inherent subjectivity in any research endeavor, adopts a balanced and realistic approach, acknowledging that, unlike exact sciences such as mathematics, where there is a widely accepted theoretical and practical consensus, economics is a social science, and the fields of economic intelligence, competitive intelligence, and economic espionage accommodate different perspectives and approaches. Therefore, the thesis first presents a synthesis and analysis of the key elements addressed in the global specialized literature, followed by the introduction of a personal viewpoint.

The work emphasizes that careful planning, relevant data collection, multidisciplinary analysis, and the effective use of economic intelligence constitute not only a science but also an art, both essential for integrating public and private interests into strategies aimed at enhancing economic competitiveness.

In conclusion, the author expresses confidence that this work will contribute, on the one hand, to the expansion of academic knowledge and the establishment of a set of best practices in the field, and on the other hand, will stimulate interest in future research, providing a reference framework designed to support the development of mechanisms for aligning public and private interests in the context of new challenges arising in the international business environment

**Keywords:** economic intelligence, competitive intelligence, economic espionage, national competitiveness

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**OVERVIEW** E
**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** iv

**1. INTRODUCTION AND THEORETICAL FOUNDATION** 1
1.1 Details on the research topic and introduction of the main terms 2
1.2 The scientific framework of the research topic and the impact of identified changes on international economic relations 5
1.3 The innovative element and the relevance of the topic in the context of the evolving business environment 6
1.4 Purpose and objectives of the research 8

**2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY** 10
2.1 Evaluation and validation of results 14
2.2 Evaluation of the obtained results and their relevance to the research goals and objectives 15
2.3 Chapter-by-chapter results 15
2.4 General results 16
2.5 Research limitations 17

**3. RESEARCH MOTIVATION** 19
3.1 Defining the hypothesis and formulating questions to explore the implications of economic intelligence, competitive intelligence, and economic espionage policies on the business environment 19
3.2 The main research question 20
3.3 Secondary questions guiding chapter results 20

**4. FROM DOMAIN TO CONCEPT AND BACK: ANALYSIS OF THE CONTINUOUS EVOLUTION OF THE NOTION OF INTELLIGENCE** 24
4.1 Semantic analysis of the intelligence concept 30
4.2 Conclusions from the semantic analysis 38
4.3 Analytical observations 39

**5. INTELLIGENCE: A MULTIDIMENSIONAL CONCEPT – PROCESS, ORGANIZATION, PRODUCT (POP)** 41
5.1 Critical observations 45
5.2 Chapter conclusions 47

**6. FROM REQUEST TO VALUE: ANALYSIS OF THE STAGES IN THE INTELLIGENCE PROCESS** 51
6.1 Planning stage 54
6.1.1 Observations 58
6.2 Information collection stage 59
6.2.1 Open-source information collection: subdomain and method 62
6.2.2 HUMINT: subdomain and method in information collection 69
6.2.3 Conclusions 98
6.2.4 Critical observations 99
6.3 Information evaluation stage in the intelligence process 101
6.4 Analysis stage in the intelligence process - specific methods 104
6.4.1 Organizational structure analysis 105
6.4.2 Porter’s Five Forces analysis 111
6.4.3 Competitor profile analysis 112
6.4.4 Patent analysis 113
6.4.5 Risk analysis 114
6.4.6 Risk analysis in the business environment 119
6.4.7 Benchmarking analysis 122
6.4.8 Analysis of Competing Hypotheses (ACH) 122
6.4.9 Bayesian analysis of competing hypotheses 129
6.4.10 Scenario analysis 132
6.5 Dissemination of the final product in the intelligence process 135

**7. ANALYSIS OF CONCEPTUAL DIFFERENCES BETWEEN ECONOMIC INTELLIGENCE, COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE, ECONOMIC ESPIONAGE, AND OTHER TYPES OF BUSINESS INTELLIGENCE** 138
7.1 Historical perspective 138
7.2 Analysis of the concept of economic intelligence 143
7.2.1 Conclusions on economic intelligence activities 151
7.2.2 Defining the concept of private economic intelligence 153
7.2.3 Taxonomy of business intelligence categories 156
7.3 Analysis of the concept of competitive intelligence 159
7.3.1 Importance of the competitive intelligence function 164
7.3.2 Stages of competitive intelligence implementation 166
7.3.3 Organizing corporate intelligence departments 167
7.3.4 Conclusions on corporate intelligence 172
7.4 Analysis of the concept of economic espionage: Navigating between necessity and opportunity 172
7.5 Justifying economic espionage acts: A reasoning analysis 179
7.6 Chapter conclusions 188

**8. ANALYSIS OF NATIONAL ECONOMIC INTELLIGENCE SYSTEMS IN THE CONTEXT OF CONVERGENCE BETWEEN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE INTERESTS IN THE BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT** 191
8.1 The Japanese model: Analysis of the ability to integrate public and private interests into the economic intelligence system 194
8.2 The German model in shaping the economic intelligence system 200
8.3 The American model in organizing the economic intelligence system 202
8.4 The Swedish model in the economic intelligence system 209
8.5 The role of the French model in shaping the economic intelligence system 213
8.6 The contribution of the Canadian model to the economic intelligence system 217
8.7 The role of the British model in developing the economic intelligence system 219
8.8 The economic intelligence model in the Russian Federation 220
8.9 Conclusions 224

**9. ECONOMIC INTELLIGENCE, COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE, AND ECONOMIC ESPIONAGE AS CENTRAL DOMAINS IN THE NEW ECONOMIC ACTION PARADIGM** 227
9.1 Challenges 235
9.2 Observations 235
9.3 Chapter conclusions 237

**10. PRELIMINARY GENERAL CONCLUSIONS** 239
10.1 The dilemma of economic intelligence systems 247
10.2 Final conclusions on the research 248
10.3 Critical argument 255
10.4 Recommendations 258

**APPENDIX A. DESCRIPTION OF DEFAULT SUBHEADING SCHEME** 263

**11. Bibliography** 264
**LIST OF TABLES** 279
**LIST OF FIGURES** 280

**SUMMARY**

The doctoral thesis titled **"Economic Intelligence, Competitive Intelligence, and Economic Espionage: New Developments in Public and Private Interests in the Business Environment"** offers an innovative contribution to the field of international economic relations. It examines the interaction between public and private interests in the global business environment, highlighting the impact of economic, competitive intelligence, and economic espionage on economic competitiveness. Furthermore, the thesis presents best practices for harmonizing public and private interests and proposes a paradigm shift that allows for the utilization of synergies between the public and private sectors to enhance national competitiveness.

**1. Introduction: Methodology, Objectives, and Purpose**

The purpose of the research is to explore and evaluate how the unification of public and private interests, through the concepts of *economic intelligence*, *competitive intelligence*, and *economic espionage*, can lead to increased economic competitiveness. In a globalized context, these domains become essential for the protection and promotion of states' economic interests.

The methodology of the thesis is interdisciplinary, combining:

* **Synthesis of specialized literature**, to build a solid theoretical framework.
* **Case studies**, to analyze how intelligence concepts are applied in different economic contexts.
* **Qualitative and quantitative analysis**, to evaluate the impact of economic and competitive intelligence measures on the business environment.
* **Logical argumentation**, to test the validity of the hypotheses.

The main objectives of the thesis are:

1. **Synthesis of existing studies**, to integrate knowledge from the field and provide a foundation for future research.
2. **Analysis of interactions between intelligence and economic interests** of nations in the context of global competitiveness.
3. **Exploration of the unification of public and private interests**, to demonstrate how these interests can be integrated into various stages of the economic intelligence process.
4. **Identification of best practices** in economic intelligence, applied by nations with developed economies to increase economic competitiveness.

**2. Detailed Chapter Description**

**Chapter 1: Introduction and Theoretical Foundations**

This chapter establishes the theoretical foundations of the thesis, explaining the concepts of *economic intelligence*, *competitive intelligence*, and *economic espionage*. The author begins by defining the main terms and their importance for the international business environment. The main purpose of this chapter is to highlight the impact of these domains on national economies and to explore how the interaction between public and private interests can generate organic economic growth. The author argues that integrating private and public interests into economic strategies is essential for adapting to new global challenges.

**Chapter 2: Research Methodology**

This chapter presents the methodology applied in the research, emphasizing a multidisciplinary and integrated approach. It describes in detail the techniques of theoretical and empirical analysis, including literature review, case studies, and quantitative and qualitative methods. The methodological innovation lies in using these techniques in an integrated manner, aiming to deeply explore the impact of *economic intelligence*, *competitive intelligence*, and *economic espionage* on the international business environment.

**Chapter 3: Motivation for the Research**

The motivation for the research arises from the need to understand how states and companies can protect and promote their economic interests in an increasingly competitive global context. The author explains the challenges posed by economic espionage and the growing importance of information security in the modern business environment. The thesis emphasizes how *economic intelligence* can become a key tool for creating competitive advantage and ensuring a stable business environment.

**Chapter 4: From Domain to Concept and Back: Analysis of the Continuous Evolution of the Notion of Intelligence**

In this chapter, the author seeks to explain the evolution of the concept of *intelligence* from an applied domain to a theoretical concept and back again. The chapter offers a historical and theoretical analysis of intelligence, highlighting how the concept has expanded from military and governmental domains to the economic sphere. This analysis adds value to understanding how intelligence is used today to manage economic risks and gain competitive advantages.

**Chapter 5: Intelligence: A Multidimensional Concept – Process, Organization, Product (POP)**

This chapter explores the multidimensional nature of *intelligence*, both as an organizational process and as an informational product. The author discusses how organizations can use intelligence to make better-informed strategic decisions, focusing on how economic information is collected, analyzed, and disseminated within companies and government agencies. The chapter is innovative in its detailed approach to how intelligence can become a central pillar of economic development.

**Chapter 6: From Request to Value: Analysis of the Stages of the Intelligence Process**

This chapter thoroughly analyzes each stage of the *intelligence process*, from planning and collection to evaluation and dissemination. The author presents the methods and techniques used at each stage, including benchmarking and risk analysis. The innovation lies in applying these methods in the global economic environment, offering concrete solutions for how states and companies can gain competitive advantages through the effective use of economic intelligence.

**Chapter 7: Analysis of the Conceptual Differences between Economic Intelligence, Competitive Intelligence, Economic Espionage, and Other Types of Business Intelligence**

This chapter discusses the essential differences between various forms of *intelligence*, such as *economic intelligence*, *competitive intelligence*, and *economic espionage*. The author provides conceptual clarification and explains how these types of intelligence are used to support both public and private interests. The analysis contributes to a better understanding of how organizations can use intelligence to maximize economic advantages and protect national interests.

**Chapter 8: Analysis of National Economic Intelligence Systems in the Context of Convergence between Public and Private Interests**

This chapter provides a comparative analysis of different national *economic intelligence* systems from countries such as Japan, Germany, the USA, and France. The author highlights how these states integrate public and private interests into their intelligence strategies, contributing to their enhanced economic competitiveness. The analysis offers valuable lessons for other states seeking to implement similar practices.

**Chapter 9: Economic Intelligence, Competitive Intelligence, and Economic Espionage: Central Domains in the New Economic Action Paradigm**

This chapter analyzes the challenges and opportunities in the global business environment, emphasizing the importance of integrating *economic intelligence*, *competitive intelligence*, and *economic espionage* into national economic strategies. The author argues that these domains must become central to the new economic action paradigm to ensure sustainable and competitive development.

**3. Chapter 10: General Conclusions**

Chapter 10 concludes the thesis by emphasizing the importance of applying the concepts of *economic intelligence* and *competitive intelligence* to protect and promote national economic interests. The author stresses that, to face the new global economic challenges, closer collaboration between the public and private sectors is essential. The key conclusions include:

1. **Practical applicability of intelligence**: Strategies for *economic intelligence* and *economic espionage* can bring significant competitive advantages if used effectively.
2. **The central role of public-private synergy**: Collaboration between the state and the private sector is crucial for ensuring economic security and increasing competitiveness.
3. **The need for adaptation**: In the face of emerging risks, states and companies must quickly adapt their economic and intelligence strategies to remain competitive.

**4. Added Value of the Thesis**

The **added value** of the thesis lies in its theoretical and practical contributions to the field of international economic relations and the study of *economic intelligence*. The author brings the following innovative elements:

1. **A new theoretical framework** for understanding the relationship between intelligence and economic competitiveness, which helps clarify how states can integrate these concepts to gain economic advantages.
2. **A comparative analysis of intelligence systems** from different countries, offering valuable lessons for the development of more efficient national economic policies.
3. **An interdisciplinary approach**, combining economic, security, and business management perspectives to provide practical solutions to the current challenges in the global business environment.

The thesis has the potential to become an academic reference and stimulate future research in the field of *economic intelligence*, *competitive intelligence*, and *economic espionage*, thus contributing to a better understanding of how states and companies can collaborate to protect and foster economic growth.